



Performance of Relocation Policy Implementation at Purbalingga Food Center

Karina Nuur Annisa, Slamet Rosyadi, Lilis Sri Sulistiani

Jurusan Administrasi Publik, Universitas Jenderal Soedirman, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFORMATION

Received: February 08, 2022
Revised: August 03, 2022
Available online: October 31, 2022

KEYWORDS

Policy Performance, Street vendors, Relocation

CORRESPONDENCE

Name: Karina Nuur Annisa
E-mail: karinanuurannisa29@gmail.com

A B S T R A C T

The relocation policy is a government action in an effort to reposition street vendors from one place to another, which is considered more appropriate for several reasons and purposes. The purpose of this study is to find out how the performance of the relocation policy at the Purbalingga Food Center is based on aspects of communication, access, coverage, accountability, and program adjustment to needs. The results of this study explain that the performance of the implementation of this relocation policy when viewed based on aspects of communication, access to accountability, and program adjustments to needs that have been running well, but not optimal. This happens because there is no adjustment to the type of trade with the facilities provided and there is a lack of adequate facilities. To be able to improve the performance of the implementation of this relocation policy, the policy organizers must provide training and guidance to the actors at the Purbalingga Food Center consistently and sustainably, as well as maintain and improve all aspects, namely communication, access, accountability, and program suitability, that have been going well, in order to achieve maximum policy objectives.

INTRODUCTION

This research study will discuss the Performance of Relocation Policy Implementation at Food Centers in Purbalingga Regency. The higher population growth causes an imbalance between the number of job opportunities and the labor force (Liu et al., 2017). As it is known, most of the jobs in urban areas are engaged in the formal sector, namely in the non-agricultural sector, which includes mining, industry, trade, and service businesses, which usually require a workforce with a fairly high level of education (Idham & Satrianto, 2019). However, in reality, most of the population of the labor force in Indonesia do not have high enough education and skills so that they do not meet the criteria for available jobs (Usman & Sentosa, 2020). This is certainly one of the factors that causes socio-economic problems in society. As humans, we certainly have needs to live that must be fulfilled. Therefore, with limited ability, they try to survive to make ends meet (Nasrullah, 2015; Oktaviana, 2021).

Development is a step taken by the government in an effort to reduce poverty and unemployment to improve and improve people's welfare (Chakrabarti, 2018). Economic activities are divided into two, namely the formal sector where the activity or business field is licensed by an authorized official and registered at a government office, while the informal sector is a business field that does not have a business official, does not have a permit from the government, and is not registered with the government agency (Altındağ et al., 2020). The majority of them are obtained through experience, come from their own families, and the products or services are primarily consumed by people with lower middle incomes (Welter et al., 2015).

Street vendors are one of the most common informal sector economic activities found in urban areas of developing countries, such as Indonesia (Fitriana et al., 2020; Handoyo, 2014; Marhawati, 2020). According to McGee & Yeung (1979) "street vendors" are defined as people who peddle goods and services for sale in a place that is a space for the public interest, especially roadsides and sidewalks. Business in this field is

growing all the time. Trading activities carried out through this activity are very diverse, such as selling food, clothing, cigarettes, and other necessities that are relatively cheap. In choosing a location for selling, street vendors usually sell their wares in places that are considered strategic, including sidewalks (Mardeliah et al., 2021; Pramutoko, 2021). According to the Big Indonesian Dictionary, a sidewalk is the edge of a large road that is slightly higher than the road, where people walk. Many traders use the sidewalk as a place to sell their goods, causing inconvenience to pedestrians.

Therefore, the existence of street vendors is often considered illegal because they occupy public spaces and are not in accordance with the city's vision, which mostly emphasizes the aspects of cleanliness, beauty, and tidiness of the city (Helminasari, 2018). Therefore, street vendors' policies are often the main targets of city government policies, such as evictions and relocations. This PKL relocation policy frequently raises pros and cons (Pasciana et al., 2019). Some people support the relocation because PKL trade locations are frequently on the sidewalk, which should function as a pedestrian path. Meanwhile, some traders who refuse the relocation policy because they feel comfortable with the previous location tend to be lazy about adapting to the new location (Imanda & Rusdarti, 2020). This is due to the length of time the traders have occupied the location (Widodo et al., 2016). There is concern that the relocation of trading locations will reduce the amount of income that street vendors in the previous location had (Thoriq & Samsudin, 2018). Although street vendors have a positive impact on the community's economy, the relocation of trading locations must still be carried out for road control (Dwi Rahmawati & Fauzi, 2021; Imanda & Rusdarti, 2020; Ramadhan, 2015).

The government often moves the location of street vendors to new places (Prasetya & Fauziah, 2021). Therefore, the relocation decision is often unilateral, even though there has been socialization beforehand, but traders can't do much because they can't change policies (Hadinata & Ruchimat, 2018). In that way, sometimes the complaints of the night owls

about declining incomes create new problems. It can be said that the problem of street vendors is inseparable from the problem of population growth and urban growth (Septiawan et al., 2019). In the economic and social structure of Indonesia, most of them belong to the lower economic class. A prominent characteristic of these street vendors is their violation in the sale of goods, which is a violation of the law against the applicable regulations (Erlinda et al., 2014; Kimbal, 2015).

In addition to what is happening in various parts of Indonesia, the city of Purbalingga has a unique problem with a large number of PKL that is still not available in some areas. Many PKLs are actively working to improve the quality of life in Purbalingga, thereby contributing to the city's positive growth. As a government, you must be able to address the problem quickly and effectively, by empowering citizens, whether they are *lima pedagang* or consumers, to deal with the current situation. The public policy that must be implemented in order to address the problem at hand is *alokasi space*. The government is not only responsible for public policy and providing information, but it is also responsible for finding solutions to problems. Public policies are decisions that are binding on the people at a strategic or outline level, made by public authorities (Koliba et al., 2018). Public policies must be made by public authorities, namely those who receive a mandate from the public or the people, generally through an electoral process, to act on behalf of the people (Stein, 2015). Furthermore, public policies will be implemented by the state administration run by the government bureaucracy. Implementation is the process of implementing certain programs that have been formulated and stipulated in a rule to achieve an outcome (outcome) that has been determined in the regulation (Agustino, 2016). Implementation is needed because there are policy problems that need to be addressed and solved, because implementation connects policy objectives and their realization with the results of government activities. with the hope that the policy can provide optimal results in accordance with the objectives to be achieved (Hutahayan JF, 2019). So, to produce optimal results requires aspects in it that support the implementation process. In other words, public policy is a way to achieve common goals that are aspired to as management of achieving goals (Hayat, 2018).

Until the end of 2019, the Regent of Purbalingga made the arrangement of street vendors a serious problem that needed to be carried out with a separate, more intensive approach. In an effort to relocate, the Regent of Purbalingga approached the unorganized PKL circles, namely the humanizing PKL approach. This approach is carried out by discussing the ideal of an arrangement for street vendors. After conducting a long study, Purbalingga district finally issued a policy regarding the relocation of street vendors (PKL). It is listed in Purbalingga Regent Regulation Number 94 of 2019 concerning the Arrangement and Designation of Locations as Selling Points for Street Vendors in Purbalingga District. This policy began to be implemented in early January 2020. Street vendors are one of the most involved and diverse activities in the informal sector. In an effort to realize the hopes of the Purbalingga Regional Government, namely the alignment of street vendor activities with smooth traffic, aesthetic cleanliness, and the function of regional infrastructure, it is necessary to arrange street vendors in the business location area, and in the context of structuring and empowering street vendors, an area has been built to sell to street vendors in Purbalingga District.

These expectations can certainly be realized if the community can provide the best contribution to achieve the goals that have been set by choosing the right policies. In addition, implementing organizations need to accommodate them because the authority and various types of resources to support the implementation of the strategy or plan are within the organization. While impacts are usually positive or negative, organizations also need to create the policy environment and conditions to produce an effect. Therefore, if the environment has a positive view of the strategy, it will produce positive support, so that the environment will affect the success of policy implementation. Street vendors in Purbalingga are scattered in various sub-districts and city centers. The number of street vendors in the center of Purbalingga City is approximately 569 street vendors. The numbers are still divided in several places in Purbalingga, including Purbalingga Square, in front of SMA Muhammadiyah, Jalan Piere Tendean, GOR Goentoer Darjono, Curgecang Food Center, street vendors in front of RSIA Panti Nugroho, and street vendors in Kya-ky Mayong. The large number of street vendors scattered in the city center made the Regent of Purbalingga make a relocation policy for street vendors who initially traded in the square, in front of SMA Muhammadiyah, Jalan Piere Tendean, and GOR Goentoer Darjono into one place at the Purbalingga Food Center. The following is the number of traders affected by relocation by gender.

Table 1. Number of Street Vendors in Purbalingga Food Center by Gender

No.	Gender	Quantity
1.	Female	124 people
2.	Male	245 people
	Total	369 people

Source :Dinas Perindustrian dan Perdagangan 2020

Based on table 1, this relocation process moved 124 female street vendors and 245 male street vendors. Thus, around 369 street vendors have been relocated to the Purbalingga Food Center. Of course, with the large number of traders who have been relocated, there are various types of different merchandise. Ranging from food to children's toy services, the following is the number of traders after being relocated based on the type of sale.

Table 2. Street Vendor Situation Based on Type of Sales

No.	Type of Sales	Quantity
1.	Food	207 merchants
2.	Drinks	52 merchants
3.	Grocery	11 merchants
4.	Clothing	27 merchants
5.	Accessories	13 merchants
6.	Children's Toy Services	50 merchants
7.	Others	9 merchants
	Total	369 merchants

Source :Dinas Perindustrian dan Perdagangan 2020

It can be seen from table 2 above that there are several types of sales by street vendors who have been relocated to the Purbalingga Food Center, including food, in the form of meatballs, fried rice, fried chicken, and others. Then, there are various kinds of beverage vendors; grocery traders; clothing; accessories; children's toy services; and others. The large number

of traders gave rise to various opinions regarding this relocation policy. After various processes have been passed, the traders are willing to be relocated to the Purbalingga Food Center and leave the previous place by producing an agreement between the traders and the policy organizers. So, since the previous location is now deserted, there are no traders selling because of the district government's prohibition. The traders said that the stalls provided were only 2 by 2 meters, which was too small to place carts. The cart facilities provided were also ineffective because they were too small to be used by all traders who needed more space for equipment. trade. Although the local government has built parks as an effort to increase visitors, this in fact does not have much impact on traders. The number of street vendors who trade but lack of visitors and buyers causes the impression of competition. Some traders stop trading at the Purbalingga Food Center and look for other more promising locations. This can also be caused by inadequate facilities and infrastructure.

It is different from the previous research conducted by [Amelia \(2021\)](#) with the title "Implementation of Relocation Policy in Banjarnegara Regency". It can be seen that the relocation policy to the Banjarnegara Culinary Center is more mature because it prepares facilities and infrastructure first before the relocation process is carried out. By building a building as a location for selling and already equipped with supporting facilities, So, street vendors just place themselves in their respective stalls that have been determined, making the Banjarnegara Culinary Center look orderly, clean, and comfortable. This makes the relocation policy effective. For this reason, research on the performance of the implementation of the relocation policy of street vendors is important because there are still traders who are not satisfied. For this reason, it is necessary to conduct a study of this research to find out the actual performance in implementing government policies in relocating street vendors with the object of research at the Purbalingga Food Center.

METHOD

This study uses a descriptive qualitative type of research with a post-positivistic paradigm that is critical realism. However, it recognizes that observations may involve errors and that theories can be modified ([Trochim, 2001](#)). According to [Moleong \(2010\)](#) qualitative research is research that intends to understand phenomena that are experienced by research subjects such as behavior, perceptions, motivations, actions, and others holistically by means of descriptions in the form of words and language, in a context of nature and by utilizing various scientific methods. In collecting data through interviews, observations, and documentation with data source triangulation techniques to check the validity of the data. This study uses an interactive model data analysis technique consisting of data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions using the theory of which focuses on aspects of communication, access to accountability, and program adjustment. with the needs that are already running well ([Edward III, 1980](#); [Hajjar & Sharkansky, 1970](#)). The informants of the Board of Commission II related to the management of the Purbalingga Food Center were obtained using the purposive sampling technique; the heads of fields and staff for empowering traders at the Department of Industry and Trade, as well as the chairman of the association and traders of the Purbalingga Food Center.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This study aims to find out how the performance strategy for implementing the relocation policy of street vendors at the Purbalingga Food Center is listed in the Purbalingga Regent Regulation Number 94 of 2019 concerning Structuring and Designating Locations as Selling Places for Street Vendors in the Purbalingga District. In this study, researchers used the theory of [Edward III, \(1980\)](#) & [Hajjar & Sharkansky \(1970\)](#). Further discussion of the indicators in the performance research on the implementation of the PKL Relocation Policy at the Purbalingga Food Center is as follows:

Communication

Communication according to [Lasswell \(2015\)](#) is "a convenient way to describe an act of communication is to answer the following questions: Who Says What in Which Channel To Whom With What Effect". So, it can be said that communication, according to Lasswell, is the process of delivering messages by communicators to communicants through media that cause certain effects. In this case, an important function in the communication aspect is the function of information through various forms of communication activities, one of which is face-to-face communication and socialization. Because communication is one of the important factors that determine the successful implementation of a public policy. Therefore, in the process of relocating street vendors to the Purbalingga Food Center, socialization was held beforehand so that traders would get clarity and so that it would facilitate the relocation process.

This socialization was carried out formally in the hall of the Industry and Trade Office nine times within a period of one year, which was attended by the chairman of the association, representatives of traders, and related OPD, namely Satpol PP, Department of Transportation, Dinporapar, Purbalingga Kidul Village, and Kota District. The Head of the Trade Division of the Industry and Trade Office was one of the policy organizers who provided information and explained in detail, from the initial stages to the master plan to be carried out. With the aim of controlling the layout of the city, the policy organizers convinced street vendors to be willing to be moved to a legal and appropriate place intended to sell for traders, although at first there were some rejections from traders because they were worried that their sales would decline due to moving to a new place. But with this socialization, there is an agreement that occurs, namely asking the policy organizers to complete the facilities and infrastructure first, not just provide a place. Because it is still in the early stages of the experiment, the traders also asked to be exempted from retribution fees, electricity, water, and restaurant taxes. This certainly provides clarity to traders, so traders are willing to be relocated.

Based on the results of the interviews, it can be said that the socialization carried out by the policy organizers has been good. Because this socialization was carried out long before the relocation process was carried out, with a regular schedule of one to two meetings a month. The Trade Service carried out this socialization with the aim of introducing and providing understanding to traders regarding the rules contained in the Purbalingga Regent Regulation Number 94 of 2019 concerning Structuring and Designating Locations as Selling Places for Street Vendors in the Purbalingga District. The information provided by the policy organizers is also carried out in a sustainable and consistent manner. In conveying information,

policy makers use materials and language that are easy to understand, so that the socialization process is in accordance with existing guidelines. If there is an explanation that is not understood, traders can also ask again. By providing the information provided at the time of socialization that has been provided by the policy implementers, it has been consistent so that it can support the suitability of the program when applied in the field and reduce obstacles that may occur. One of the factors supporting the success of the policy is the provision of information that is easily understood by the target group. Therefore, based on the description above, it is concluded that the socialization carried out by the policy organizers can be said to have been effective. This can be seen based on the results of the interview above because of the lack of obstacles experienced during the relocation process to the Purbalingga Food Center.

Access

Access is an aspect of knowing that the program or service provided is easily accessible by the target group, so that it can be seen how easy it is for the target group to get services from the policies that have been implemented. This form of access can be seen by how easy it is for street vendors to contact the person in charge of implementing the policy and ensuring that all traders have equal opportunities without discrimination. Based on the results of interviews, in the process of implementing this relocation policy, the ease with which traders can talk to program organizers has gone well, because traders claim that it is very easy to communicate with policy organizers. This statement is supported by the results of an interview with one of the traders, who said that "Yes, I think it's easy. Because we coordinate with each other, for example, there is a problem. Here we first brief what we want to convey and then have a joint audience. Just like that, sometimes we are invited back and forth. Especially this... I'll just be honest; the traders need what we can call 'directly' or 'japri WA.'" The Department of Industry and Trade always coordinates with the association if there are obstacles experienced by traders. The WhatsApp group message service that is provided is also very helpful for traders if there are urgent complaints, so traders do not need to report directly to the industry and trade office.

In this case related to the follow-up of complaints and reporting of traders, the agency will immediately respond by checking the location to see first what the problem is. Because the speed of response in solving a problem experienced by traders depends on how complex the obstacles are, if the obstacles are simple, it does not take long to resolve the merchant's complaints. Then for the suitability of traders in getting services from the Department of Industry and Trade, it has been going well because traders have received equal and equal opportunities without discriminating against the background of each trader. As long as the merchant fulfills the existing requirements, all forms of service and access to communication are equal. So, based on the description above, it can be concluded that overall, in terms of access related to ease of getting services, ease of getting information, and equality in getting services, it has been going well.

Scope

A scope is something that is used to see how big the target group is that can be reached (getting services and so on) by the implemented public policy. In this relocation policy, the target groups are street vendors selling around the square and GOR Goentoer Darjono, totaling 369 traders. It is known

that prior to the relocation, the Department of Industry and Trade provided guidance to street vendors. The guidance is related to increasing the ability of traders to develop their businesses as well as coaching in maintaining environmental cleanliness and order. With this coaching, the Purbalingga Food Center will become more comfortable, so it is expected to increase the number of visitors.

Based on interviews that have been conducted regarding how the program organizers facilitate and foster street vendors at the Purbalingga Food Center, it is still not optimal. As one of the PFC traders said, "Yes, for us, yes for facilities, because it is still in a temporary state, it is not yet optimal. For example, carts are all uniformed, not adjusted to the type of sale. So there are traders who modify it themselves. There are still shortcomings, but we can complement each other's shortcomings." Then one of the visitors to PFC also added that "The facilities are still lacking even though they have been relocated, such as sewers, trash cans, public toilets are also inadequate, and there are still puddles of water around the PFC, and then the parking space is still very limited. The seating area around the PFC is also minimal, even though if there were seating facilities or a gazebo, it would make people feel more comfortable while enjoying PFC food.

In the distribution of facilities, there are several provided by the policy organizers, namely carts, stoves, gas, coolboxes, tents, selling land, water, and electricity, which are still free until now. Although many are given by policy organizers, the distribution of facilities in the form of goods is not evenly distributed, so there are still traders who have not received these facilities. There are several facilities that are not appropriate and in accordance with the needs of the type of trade. This is because the assistance comes from the center, so that everything is evenly distributed, and some traders who are given cart facilities are not used because they cannot be used for the type of sale. Based on observations, there are inadequate supporting facilities such as toilets, which only amount to 2 units, prayer rooms that still use wooden planks, trash cans, and limited seats. In addition, crowds of visitors occur only on holidays, if after the rain there is a puddle of water that disturbs visitors, and the lack of available land makes the traders' stalls narrow and limited. So, based on the description above, it can be said that the coverage aspect regarding the provision of facilities and infrastructure is still not running optimally.

Accountability

According to Bastian (2001), accountability is the obligation to convey accountability or to answer, explain, and convey the performance and actions of a person or legal entity, collective or organizational leadership, to parties who have the right or authority to ask for information or accountability. It can be said that accountability is the basis for implementing government functions. This accountability principle is not implemented in isolation, but is linked to other principles such as the principle of transparency. In this case, accountability relates to the responsibility of policy administrators in carrying out their functions and assessing whether the actions of policy administrators in carrying out their duties to deliver policy outputs to target groups can be accounted for.

Based on the results of the interview, it can be said that the organizers' accountability has been going well. seen in the results of interviews where traders admitted that there were no procedural irregularities, requests for money, or discrimination.

This was conveyed by the head of the association in an interview. So far, one of the agreements I have heard is that when you enter there is no fee, so the retribution is empty. This means that there is no deviation because there is no report, as we know. Then it is related to land as usufructuary rights." Then, regarding the suitability of the rights obtained, the traders said that they got the appropriate rights without any reduction in either facilities or services, as stated in the Purbalingga Regent Regulation Number 94 of 2019 concerning Structuring and Designating Locations as Selling Points for Street Vendors in the District of Purbalingga. Regarding the complaints of some traders who complained because they felt that they had a less strategic place, this was because it had been arranged according to the association's member number, besides that there were rules for revocation of stall rights if the merchant did not sell for two months.

In the supervisory system, the office always conducts routine monitoring to monitor the progress of the traders, while at the same time accepting if there are complaints or aspirations that traders want to convey. For transparency, policy organizers are also being open in managing the relocation process. However, regarding financial reports, because the policy organizers are not included in financial management, there are no detailed financial reports to traders, but if there is development carried out, the policy organizers openly convey the costs incurred. This is proven in the results of interviews that in every meeting discussion of the programs that will be carried out by the organizers always invites representatives of the association. Based on the description above, it can be concluded that the accountability of the policy implementers has been working well. So that in this case, in all forms of action by the policy organizers in supporting the success of the relocation program, there is transparency regarding the suitability of rights obtained by the target group, a monitoring system, and transparency in management. This is in accordance with government regulations in the management of regional finances, which can be managed by adopting several main principles in improving good governance, including openness, a sense of responsibility by observing the principles of justice intended for the community, involvement, and compliance (Fahzura and Najamuddin., 2022).

Program Suitability in Relation to Needs

Because it can support their welfare, the suitability of the program to their needs is an important aspect in the success of a policy. This can see how various target policy or program outputs received by the group match their needs or not. So it can be seen whether this relocation policy is in accordance with what is needed by street vendors at Purbalingga Food Center.

Based on interviews about the programs that have been given according to the needs of the perpetrators. This is evidenced by what the head of the association said in an interview, "So far, we think it's good. It's pretty good, just touching the government, step by step, it's being built in relation to a permanent roof. But so far we have seen that it is good, because those who used to use tents that had the potential to run away if there was a rainstorm, maybe this is because with the permanent existence, they feel more comfortable in selling and buyers are also comfortable in enjoying culinary at PFC. " It's just that one trader added that "I think it's done, it's just lacking in management, because there are still some facilities that are not right, then the placement is not enough, and now

the PFC is being repaired again. So, if the perpetrator moves back and forth, it should have been provided from the start. So it can be said that this policy is less effective. We shouldn't be in a hurry when making a policy. "

Basically, policies are made because they have a purpose for the benefit of the community in order to solve a certain problem. With this relocation policy, traders have a suitable and legal place to trade so that the business development of street vendors becomes more measurable. Although the level of visitor crowds is still not as high as in previous places, because of course, relocation takes time to adapt, there are some traders who stop trading, in addition to situational factors, namely the COVID-19 pandemic. This relocation policy is in accordance with the needs of the traders and has been going well, although there are some shortcomings. This policy seems too hasty because it does not prepare permanent tent facilities before the process of moving street vendors, thus making traders move around due to development. which is currently being carried out, but overall it has been going well because every policy certainly cannot satisfy all parties. As time goes by, step by step to improve the relocation policy at Purbalingga Food Center will continue to be carried out so that in the future this relocation policy will be better.

CONCLUSION

Based on the explanation of several aspects above, it can be concluded that the performance of the implementation of the relocation policy for street vendors at the Purbalingga Food Center has been going well, but has not been maximized and requires some improvements. Based on the previous discussion and conclusions, it can be seen that there are still shortcomings in the implementation of the relocation of the street vendors at the Purbalingga Food Center. The suggestions and input that researchers can give are: Provide training and coaching to traders in a consistent and sustainable manner, for example, media promotion training to help street vendors sell their products through social media and delivery service applications. By re-collecting data and holding discussion forums for policy evaluation every certain period, as well as discussing the distribution of facilities and types of trade, it can help suit the facilities provided, so that these facilities can be used and not in vain. The organizers should also provide traders with a larger kiosk size in order to make visitors and traders who sell more comfortable. As well as the need to complete various public facilities that are still lacking, one of which is adequate places of worship and public toilets, which are still very lacking in number. With the availability of various supporting facilities, it will increase the comfort of visitors so that it is possible to increase the number of visitors.

REFERENCES

- Adon Nasrullah. (2015). *Sosiologi Perkotaan Memahami Masyarakat Kota dan Problematikanya*. In *Sosiologi Perkotaan* (Vol. 2, Issue 2).
- Agustino, L. (2016). *Dasar-dasar kebijakan publik (Edisi Revisi)*. alfabeta.
- Altındağ, O., Bakış, O., & Rozo, S. V. (2020). Blessing or burden? Impacts of refugees on businesses and the informal economy. *Journal of Development Economics*, 146, 102490. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdeveco.2020.102490>
- Amelia, R. H. (2021). *Implementasi Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Kabupaten Banjarnegara Perspektif Masalah Mursalah*.
- Bastian. (2001). *Manajemen Keuangan*.

- Chakrabarti, M. (2018). Social welfare: Scottish perspective: Scottish perspective. In M. Chakrabarti (Ed.), *Social Welfare: Scottish Perspective: Scottish Perspective*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315202686>
- Dwi Rahmawati, W., & Fauzi, A. M. (2021). Perebutan Ruang Publik Pedagang Kaki Lima Pada Masa Pandemi Di Alun-Alun Jombang. *Jurnal Ilmiah Dinamika Sosial*, 5(1), 17–32. <https://doi.org/10.38043/jids.v5i1.2971>
- Edward III. (1980). *Implementing Public Policy Congressional Quarterly Press*. Washington D. C.
- Erlinda, R. D., Sutji, A. B. D. D., & Indrayati, R. (2014). Kajian Yuridis Tentang Izin Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Jalan Jawa Untuk Mewujudkan Penyelenggaraan Pemerintahan Yang Baik (Good Judicial Study About Permission Of Traders In The Jawa Street). *Jurnal Lentera Hukum*, 2, 33–42.
- Fitriana, R., Auliya, A. U., & Widiyarta, A. (2020). Analisis Kebijakan Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima Dalam Perspektif Kebijakan Deliberatif. *Jurnal Governansi*, 6(2), 93–103. <https://doi.org/10.30997/jgs.v6i2.2863>
- Hadinata, M., & Ruchimat, T. (2018). Analisis Terhadap Kebijakan Pemerintah Provinsi Dki Jakarta Tentang Penutupan Jalan Jati Baru Raya Untuk Pedagang Kaki Lima. *Jurnal Hukum Adigama*, 1(2), 228. <https://doi.org/10.24912/adigama.v1i2.2744>
- Hajjar, S., & Sharkansky, I. (1970). Policy Analysis in Political Science. *The Western Political Quarterly*, 23(4), 878. <https://doi.org/10.2307/446487>
- Handoyo, E. (2014). Kontribusi Modal Sosial Dalam Meningkatkan Kesejahteraan Pedagang Kaki Lima Pascarelokasi. *KOMUNITAS: International Journal of Indonesian Society and Culture*, 5(2). <https://doi.org/10.15294/komunitas.v5i2.2743>
- Hayat, H. (2018). *Buku Kebijakan Publik*. Universitas Islam Malang Malang, Indonesia.
- Helminasari, S. (2018). Pengaruh Sikap Pedagang Kaki Lima (Pkl) Terhadap Implementasi Peraturan Daerah Kota Samarinda Nomor 19 Tahun 2001 Tentang Pengaturan Dan Pembinaan Pedagang Kaki Lima Dalam Wilayah Kotamadya Daerah Tingkat Ii Samarinda (Studi Kasus Pada Pedagang Kaki Lima . *FisiPublik : Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Politik*, 2(2), 60–69. <https://doi.org/10.24903/fpb.v2i2.255>
- Hutahayan JF. (2019). Faktor Pengaruh Kebijakan Keterbukaan Informasi & Kinerja Pelayanan Publik (Studi Pada Pemerintah Provinsi DKI Jakarta. In *Yogyakarta*:
- Idham, M. A., & Satrianto, A. (2019). Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Penyerapan Tenaga Kerja Di Sektor Industri Dan Perdagangan Di Kabupaten/Kota Di Sumatera Barat. *Jurnal Ecogen*, 1(3), 634. <https://doi.org/10.24036/jmpe.v1i3.5037>
- Imanda, M. B., & Rusdanti, R. (2020). Kebijakan dan Implementasi Program Relokasi PKL Kawasan Tlogosari Kota Semarang. *Efficient: Indonesian Journal of Development Economics*, 3(1), 616–624. <https://doi.org/10.15294/efficient.v3i1.35955>
- Kimbal, R. W. (2015). *Modal Sosial dan Ekonomi Industri Kecil - Google Books*. 1, 242. https://www.google.co.id/books/edition/Modal_Sosial_dan_Ekonomi_Industri_Kecil/wEs0DwAAQBAJ?hl=id&gbpv=0
- Koliba, C. J., Meek, J. W., Zia, A., & Mills, R. W. (2018). Governance networks in public administration and public policy: Second edition. In *Governance Networks in Public Administration and Public Policy: Second Edition*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315268620>
- Lasswell, H. D., & Smith, B. L. (2015). *Propaganda, communication and public opinion*. Princeton University Press.
- Liu, J. X., Goryakin, Y., Maeda, A., Bruckner, T., & Scheffler, R. (2017). Global Health Workforce Labor Market Projections for 2030. *Human Resources for Health*, 15(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12960-017-0187-2>
- Mardeliah, U., Purwanti, N., & Sarapayari, F. Y. (2021). Penggunaan Ruang Publik Sebagai Tempat Berjualan Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kota Sorong. *Jurnal Noken: Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, 7(1), 44. <https://doi.org/10.33506/jn.v7i1.1554>
- Marhawati, M. (2020). Analisis Pendapatan Pedagang Kaki Lima Sektor Informal Di Kecamatan Rappocini Kota Makassar. *JEKPEND: Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Pendidikan*, 3(1), 68. <https://doi.org/10.26858/jekpend.v3i1.12374>
- McGee, T. G. & Yeung, Y. M. (1979). Hawkers in Southeast Asian Cities: Planning for the Bazaar Economy. *Geographical Review*, 69(3), 356. <https://doi.org/10.2307/214894>
- Moleong, L. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif* (P. R. Roskadarya (ed.)).
- Oktaviana, W. (2021). PENGARUH MODAL, BIAYA PRODUKSI, JUMLAH TENAGA KERJA DAN TINGKAT PENDIDIKAN TERHADAP PENDAPATAN UMKM SEKTOR KULINER DI KECAMATAN LUBUK BEGALUNG KOTA PADANG. *Horizon*, 1(2), 367–383. <https://doi.org/10.22202/horizon.2021.v1i2.4784>
- Pasciana, R., Pundenswari, P., & Sadrina, G. (2019). Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima (Pkl) Untuk Memperindah Kota Garut. *Kolaborasi : Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 5(3), 288–303. <https://doi.org/10.26618/kjap.v5i3.2649>
- Pramutoko, B. (2021). Pengaruh Pemilihan Lokasi, Daya Beli Konsumen dan Suasana terhadap Keputusan Pedagang Kaki lima Berjualan di Jalan H.O.S Cokroaminoto Kota Kediri. *JMK (Jurnal Manajemen Dan Kewirausahaan)*, 6(2), 73. <https://doi.org/10.32503/jmk.v6i2.1585>
- Prasetya, M. A., & Fauziah, L. (2021). Dampak Sosial Ekonomi Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kecamatan Buduran Kabupaten Sidoarjo. *JKMP (Jurnal Kebijakan Dan Manajemen Publik)*, 4(2), 135–150. <https://doi.org/10.21070/jkmp.v4i2.691>
- Ramadhan, A. (2015). Model Zonanisasi Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Kota Bandung (Prespektif Peraturan Daerah Kota Bandung Nomor 4 Tahun 2011 Tentang Penataan Dan Pembinaan Pedagang Kaki Lima). *Unnes Law Journal*, 4(1), 56–65.
- Septiawan, P., Nurjanah, R., & Mustika, C. (2019). Analisis pendapatan pedagang kaki lima di Kota Jambi (studi kasus pedagang kaki lima di Jalan Jenderal Basuki Rahmat sampai H. Agus Salim Kecamatan Kota Baru). *E-Jurnal Ekonomi Sumberdaya Dan Lingkungan*, 8(1), 41–53. <https://doi.org/10.22437/jels.v8i1.11966>
- Stein, J. W. (1975). Introducing public administration. In *Teaching Political Science* (Vol. 3, Issue 1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/00922013.1975.11000035>
- Thoriq, M. I., & Samsudin, M. (2018). Dilema Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima (Pkl) Ke Pasar Blauran Ii Kota Salatiga. *Gema Publik*, 3(2), 76. <https://doi.org/10.14710/gp.3.2.2018.76-84>
- Trochim, W. M. K., & Atomic, D. C. (2001). The Research Methods Knowledge Base. *Atomic Dog*.
- Usman, A. F., & Sentosa, S. U. (2020). PENGARUH UPAH SEKTOR INDUSTRI, TINGKAT PENDIDIKAN, DAN INVESTASI ASING TERHADAP PENYERAPAN TENAGA KERJA SEKTOR INDUSTRI DI INDONESIA. *Jurnal Kajian Ekonomi Dan Pembangunan*, 2(4). <https://doi.org/10.24036/jkep.v2i4.10371>
- Welter, F., Smallbone, D., & Pobol, A. (2015). Entrepreneurial activity in the informal economy: a missing piece of the entrepreneurship jigsaw puzzle. *Entrepreneurship and Regional Development*, 27(5–6), 292–306. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08985626.2015.1041259>
- Widodo, A. S., Idayanti, S., Permanasari, D. I., & Sahri, A. (2016). Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL) di Kawasan Kota Tegal. *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan : Kajian Ilmu Pemerintahan Dan Politik Daerah*, 1(1), 168. <https://doi.org/10.24905/jip.v1i1.440>